

Instructions for Discussions

Nikolaus Hautsch

Chair of Econometrics
Institute for Statistics and Econometrics
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin



Aim of a Discussion

- ▶ Giving the audience a second chance to understand the main ideas (particularly if the presentation was bad).
- ▶ Opening new viewpoints on the paper.
- ▶ Providing the audience a critical assessment of the work.
- ▶ Explaining the strengths and weaknesses of the work from an outside perspective.
- ▶ Stressing strong points and criticizing weak points.
- ▶ Giving suggestions for possible improvements and extensions.

Structure of a Discussion

1. Brief summary of the paper.
2. Specific details on the paper.
3. Own suggestions and comments.
4. Concluding remarks.

Specific Instructions

- ▶ Summarize the paper in your own way.
- ▶ Don't just replicate the presentation before.
- ▶ Don't repeat things which are obviously clear or common knowledge. (Don't waste time!)
- ▶ Try to provide a new angle and background information on the topic.
- ▶ Keep the overall time restriction into account (here: 10 minutes)! A discussion should be compact!

Criticizing the Paper

- ▶ Start with the points you like!
- ▶ If the paper is innovative, stress it!
- ▶ Formulate questions if issues in the paper are unclear.
- ▶ List the issues you find questionable (or wrong).
- ▶ Try to come up with suggestions!
- ▶ **When you have critique, don't be harsh or impolite! Be always constructive.**